

MINUTES

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
3rd Floor Conference Room, One Civic Center
7447 E. Indian School Road
April 14, 2005
5:00 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 P.M.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Ed Wimmer, Chair
B.J. Gonzales, Vice Chair
Nancy Dallett
George Hartz
Kathy Howard
Lisa Loss

Absent: Paul Winslow

Staff: Debbie Abele, HPO
Don Meserve
Bob Cafarella

Also Present: Ester Kozinets

INTRODUCTIONS AND ROLL CALL

A formal roll call confirmed members present as stated above.

Chair Wimmer introduced Ms. Lisa Loss as the newly appointed commission member. Commissioner Loss provided the Commission with information on her background.

Chair Wimmer asked the commissioners' and staff to go around the table, introduce themselves and provide background information to enable the Commission to get to know each other. Self-introductions were made.

MINUTES

March 10, 2005

Chair Wimmer requested corrections to the March 10, 2005, meeting on minutes. Page 3, fourth paragraph, first sentence should be changed to read: Chair Wimmer inquired about the line going through the building on the map. On page 3, eighth paragraph should be changed to read: Commissioner Winslow stated that the Commission should nudge the building owner's toward replacing the lettering.

Commissioner Hartz made a motion to approve the minutes of the March 10, 2005 meeting as amended. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Gonzales and passed unanimously 6-0.

DESIGNATION OF TALIESIN WEST

Ms. Abele reviewed the approach and background on the efforts to designate Taliesin West on the Scottsdale Historic Register and how we are involved with the changing circumstances. She discussed the leadership changes at Taliesin West and the Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation and how that has affected the schedule for designation. She reported the next step would be to determine the boundaries for designation and start developing a preservation plan for the property.

Ms. Abele provided information on the difference between the Taliesin Fellowship and the Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation. The Taliesin Associates architectural firm no longer exists.

Ms. Abele reviewed the terms of the 2003 Taliesin West Preservation Agreement between the City and the Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation. A copy of the agreement had been sent to the Commissioners before the meeting. She explained that the Commission was not a party to this agreement. Mr. Meserve reported improvements outlined in the agreement were funded with bed tax funds, and that Kathy O'Connor Carlisle in the Economic Vitality Department and the Tourism Development Commission oversee and monitor the terms of the contract for the City.

The Commission reviewed and discussed the proposed boundaries. Ms. Abele reported staff used the guidelines in the National Register Bulletin, "Defining Boundaries for national Register Properties" to determine the proposed boundaries. She further reported the boundaries are up for discussion. She noted that the goal is to protect views in and out of Taliesin because the views of the surrounding desert and mountains are considered significant. She further noted that the boundaries have to be defensible enough to protect the views but small enough not to take everything. She reported staff believes the proposed boundaries would protect this resource for the community.

Ms. Abele reviewed the timeline for initiation with this HP overlay zoning proposed to get to City Council for action on the Scottsdale Historic Register designation before the end of 2005.

The Commission discussed forming a subcommittee to review the proposed boundaries and present them to the Commission. Chair Wimmer suggested delegating this to the Historic Register Committee.

Commissioner Gonzales moved to establish a sub-committee to look at the boundaries for the designation of Taliesin West and prepare a recommendation for the Commission. Second by Commissioner Howard and passed unanimously 6-0.

NEIGHBORHOOD HISTORIC DISTRICTS –TOWN AND COUNTRY SCOTTSDALE AND VILLAGE GROVE 1-6 WORKSHOP AND PUBLIC HEARINGS

Ms. Abele reported on what happened last night, April 13th, at the Planning Commission public hearing on the two neighborhood cases initiated by the Historic Preservation Commission for the first neighborhood historic districts. She further reported that the Planning Commission recommended to the City Council denial of the Town and Country Scottsdale and Village Grove 1-6 HP designation on 4-2 votes for both. She stated that it is her understanding that the City Manager indicated that the HPC has free reign to move forward in the appropriate manner to advance the preservation goals. She further stated that the Council hearing date for these two neighborhoods has not been determined but that May 17th is the tentative date under discussion.

Ms. Abele noted that staff attended the Planning Commission study session March 9th and described the selection process and criteria used in selecting the first two neighborhoods to be considered for historic

district designation and provided other information about the historic preservation program and what it means to be designated as a historically significant resource. Preservation mailed a packet to the Planning Commission after the study session to provide additional information in response to some of their questions.

Mr. Meserve stated at the Planning Commission meeting last night Commissioner Barnett stated that he thought HP designations for both these neighborhoods should be processed as Major General Plan amendments. Randy Grant, Chief Planning Officer and the attorneys present at the hearing from the City Attorney's Office remain confident that HP designations would not need a General Plan Amendment and stated this opinion to Commissioner Barnett and the Planning Commission in the hearing. Ms. Abele stated that it is anticipated that the opinions expressed by the attorneys at the hearing would be put into a memo so that the GP question will not need to be discussed at the Council level.

Ms. Abele requested the HPC consider what needs to be done to prepare for the City Council hearings on these two districts.

Ester Kozinets, visitor stated that she was at the hearing last night. She inquired if it would be appropriate to have a postcard campaign from the residents where the members of the community would send postcards in support to the City Council. Chair Wimmer replied that this is a great suggestion. He stated that he has heard one of the neighbors has already started a door-to-door campaign. Mr. Meserve stated that residents have also started to email the Mayor and City Council regarding their displeasure regarding last night's Planning Commission recommendation for denial.

The Commission discussed the following strategy to prepare for the City Council hearings on these two districts:

- Encourage residents to attend the hearing and fill out citizen comment cards.
- Encourage citizens to contact City Council regarding their support.
- Education Outreach Committee will contact people who have expressed an interest in HP to express their support.
- Commission members' personally contact the Mayor and City Council members.

The Commission discussed the fact that they undertook a rigorous two-year process and brought this information to the Planning Commission and it appears that they did not read the packet. It was noted that staff needs to continue to work on helping the Planning Commission understand the HP process.

Ms. Kozinets inquired if it would be possible to get direction from the Mayor and City Council with regard to cooperation between the two Commissions. Mr. Cafarella replied that it might come out of this process.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

Education Outreach

Commissioner Hartz reported the downtown walking tour is scheduled for Saturday, May 7, 2005, at 9:00 a.m. convening at the Little Red School House, the Scottsdale Historical Society Museum.

Historic Register

Commissioner Howard reported the Historic Register Committee talked about looking at the Garden Apartments considered eligible for designation. She further reported the next Committee meeting would be held on May 11, 2005 at 5:15 p.m.

HPO/STAFF REPORT AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Ms. Abele reported that the National Trust for Historic Preservation took a tour of the post World War II resources in Phoenix, Tempe and Scottsdale. She further reported that they unanimously felt the garden apartments in Scottsdale were some of the best, noting that it is a resource that is disappearing fast all over the nation. She added they were impressed with Scottsdale's resources.

Mr. Meserve provided information on the upcoming conferences in Flagstaff and Tucson and encouraged Commissioners to participate in the training and sessions.

FUTURE MEETINGS AND AGENDA ITEMS

Mr. Meserve stated the next meeting will be held on May 12, 2005.

Mr. Meserve acknowledged Cheryl Hancey, For the Record Court Reporters and noted that this will be the last meeting she will attend since the City now has a new contract with another company for taking minutes beginning next week. Chair Wimmer thanked Ms. Hancey for her work over the years with the Commission.

Meeting adjourned at 7:20 p.m.

Submitted by:

For the Record Court Reporters